

Report Identification Number: NY-21-097

Prepared by: New York City Regional Office

Issue Date: Feb 16, 2022

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns: A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships							
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child					
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child					
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father					
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider					
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father					
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle					
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub					
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult						
	Contacts						
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner					
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services					
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother					
CPS-Child Protective Services							
	Allegations						
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts					
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding					
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse					
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect					
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive					
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision					
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other						
	Miscellaneous						
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender					
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence					
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police					
Service	Services	Department					
PPRS-Purchased Preventive	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy	FC-Foster Care					
Rehabilitative Services	Families						
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services					
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan					
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment					
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old					
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation	ASTO-Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur						



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased Jurisdiction: Queens Date of Death: 08/29/2021

Age: 11 month(s) Gender: Female Initial Date OCFS Notified: 08/30/2021

Presenting Information

The 8/30/21 SCR report alleged on 8/27/21, the aunt was caring for her 3-yo child and the subject child. The aunt fed the children breakfast that morning and then placed them in the bathtub together to bathe them. The aunt filled the bathtub with water and then left the children without adult supervision while she went to get towels. The aunt left the children unattended for a unknown length of time during which the subject child was found floating in the tub. The aunt took the subject child out of the tub, patted her on the back and then called 911. The aunt felt 911 was asking to many questions and made the decision to take the subject child to the hospital. The subject child was later transported to another medical facility that same day. The subject child was pronounced dead at 12:22 AM on 8/29/21. The report alleged the aunt's lack of adequate supervision resulted in the subject child's death. The BM had an unknown role.

Executive Summary

The 11-month-old female subject child died on 8/29/21. As of 2/16/22, NYCRO had not received a copy of the ME's report.

At the time of the SC's death, the subject child resided with her mother, 3-yo cousin, maternal aunt, a 17-yo maternal uncle, a paternal uncle of the 3-yochild, and the father of the 3-yo. The father of the SC resided outside the US. There were no surviving siblings.

ACS learned that on 8/27/21, the mother went to work and left the subject child and her 3-yo cousin with the maternal aunt. After the children ate breakfast, the aunt placed a plastic bathmat and toys in the tub, and filled the tub for the children's bath. While the children were in the tub, the aunt went to get towels. Shortly thereafter she heard her 3-yo yell for her and she ran to the bathroom. When the aunt entered the bathroom she saw the subject child face up with her hands in fists and there was food in her mouth. The aunt grabbed both children and placed the 3-yo on the floor. The aunt attempted CPR then called 911 at 11:53AM. The aunt said the operator was asking too many questions so she hung up, called her aunt to alert her to the situation, then ran from the home with the subject child. The aunt, in haste, left her 3-yo daughter alone in the home and ran to the hospital. Upon arrival at the hospital, the subject child was immediately admitted. The child remained hospitalized until her death on 8/29/21.

On 8/31/21, a Child Safety Conference was held. ACS discussed with the adults the dangers of bathing children and leaving them unsupervised for any amount of time. The aunt expressed her willingness to participate in services and was referred for child-parent psychotherapy, play therapy, coping and parenting skills training. On 9/10/21, ACS provided the mother with information for bereavement counseling.

As of 2/16/22, ACS had not made a determination on the case.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

NY-21-097 FINAL Page 3 of 11



Time of Call:

Did EMS respond to the scene?

	and Family Services Cliffu Fatanty Report	
	Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:	
	 Approved Initial Safety Assessment? 	Yes
	o Safety assessment due at the time of determination?	N/A
	Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?	Yes
Determ	nination:	
•	Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?	The CPS report had not yet been determined at the time this Fatality report was written.
	Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?	N/A
Explai	n:	
_	PS report had not yet been determined at the time this fatality report wa	s written.
Was th	e decision to close the case appropriate?	N/A
	sework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant ry or regulatory requirements?	Yes
	ere sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?	Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.
Explain The lev	n: vel of casework activity was appropriate.	
	Required Actions Related to the Fatal	ity
Are the	ere Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)?	⊴No
	Fatality-Related Information and Investig	ative Activities
	Incident Information	
Date of	Time of Death: 08/29/2021	12:22 AM
Date of	f fatal incident, if different than date of death:	08/27/2021
	f fatal incident, if different than time of death:	11:53 AM
Counts	where fatality incident occurred:	Queens
	1 or local emergency number called?	Yes

At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? Page 4 of 11 NY-21-097 **FINAL**

11:53 AM

Unknown

N/A



Child's activity at time of in	cident:	
☐ Sleeping	☐ Working	Driving / Vehicle occupant
☐ Playing	☐ Eating	Unknown
Other: Bathing.		

Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? No - Not needed given developmental age or circumstances

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1
Adults: 0

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Aunt/Uncle	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	24 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Aunt/Uncle	No Role	Male	28 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Aunt/Uncle	No Role	Male	17 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Female	11 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	No Role	Female	19 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Other Adult - Paternal Uncle of 3-yo	No Role	Male	22
Deceased Child's Household	Other Child - cousin	Alleged Victim	Female	3 Year(s)

LDSS Response

On 8/30/21, ACS visited the case address and interviewed the BM who said she was at work at the time of the incident. The BM said the MA apologized and told her the SC ate and played with the 3-yo in the tub and while she went to get towels the incident occurred. The MA attempted CPR then ran to the hospital with the SC because the 911-operator was asking too many questions which she felt was taking too long. The BM said she understood that what occurred was an accident and explained she sometimes left the children alone for five minutes to get towels but would drain the water before leaving them.

On 8/30/21, the MA led ACS to the bathroom and informed the water in the bathtub was about halfway up the side of the tub when she bathed the children. The MA said she normally bathed the SC in the sink when the 3-yo did not want to take a bath. The SC's baths were typically quick, to wash her head and face. She never left the SC alone in the sink when she bathed her as it was more dangerous due to the sink was elevated.

On 8/30/21, the 17-yo MU said the MA informed him of what had occurred with the SC. He said the MA told him while bathing the SC and 3-yo, she left them unattended to get towels and the SC drowned. The 17-yo said he recognized it was an accident. The 17-yo MU declined therapy.

On 9/1/21, a forensic interview of the 3-yo occurred at the CAC. The 3-yo did not disclose any information. The previously implemented safety plan remained in place.

The documentation reflected that the doctors who treated the SC at both medical facilities expressed that the death was an accident caused by the SC drowning in the tub.

NY-21-097 FINAL Page 5 of 11



On 9/2/21, the family was introduced to the Early Engagement Program at a service provider agency The MA and MU agreed to services which worked with both the CH and parent.

On 9/15/21, ACS arranged for financial assistance for the child's funeral.

On 9/29/21, LE reported they had conferred with the Assistant District Attorney and decided there was no indication of criminality or abuse and ruled the incident accidental. LE informed that on 9/8/21, during a walk-through of the residence, reenactment occurred with the ME. The finding of accidental injury and death was confirmed after the reenactment.

On 12/29/21, the CW said the family was doing well in services. They were utilizing play therapy with the 3-yo.

ACS had not yet made a determination on this case at the time this report was written.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Pending

Primary Cause of Death: Pending

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

Was the fatality referred to an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?No

Comments: There is no OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team in NYC.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
059521 - Deceased Child, Female, 11 Mons	059522 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending
059521 - Deceased Child, Female, 11 Mons	059522 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Year(s)	Lack of Supervision	Pending
059521 - Deceased Child, Female, 11 Mons	059522 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Pending
059523 - Other Child - cousin, Female, 3 Year(s)	059522 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending
059523 - Other Child - cousin, Female, 3 Year(s)	059522 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Year(s)	Lack of Supervision	Pending

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?				

NY-21-097 FINAL Page 6 of 11



When appropriate, children were interviewed?	\boxtimes			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
Contact with source?	\boxtimes			
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	\boxtimes			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	\boxtimes			
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	\boxtimes			
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	\boxtimes			
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?				
Fatality Safety Assessment Activities				
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	\boxtimes			
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report:	urviving	siblings/o	ther child	dren in the
Within 24 hours?	\boxtimes			
At 7 days?	\boxtimes			
At 30 days?	\boxtimes			
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?	\boxtimes			
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?				
When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?			\boxtimes	
Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment	Profile			
Patanty Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment	TOIL			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?				
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the bousehold?				

NY-21-097 FINAL Page 7 of 11

NEW YORK STATE	Office of Children and Family Services
----------------------	--

was there an adequate assessment of th	e family Si	ieeu ioi sei	vices:				
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?							
Were appropriate/needed services offere	ed in this ca	ase					
Explain: On 8/31/21, ACS opened a service case.							
		_					
Placement	Activities in	Response to	the Fatality	Investigatio	on		
				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the siblings/other children in the household care at any time during this fatality investigation.	be remove		0				
Were there surviving children in the horas a result of this fatality report / investito this fatality?				r			
Explain as necessary: The BM had no surviving children; however the father of the 3-yo child and the paterna with the 3-yo at all times, including bath to safety plan.	l uncle of th	ne 3-yo chil	d. The moth	er of the 3	-yo child, wa	as to be s	supervised
	Legal Activ	rity Related	to the Fatalit	V			
Was there legal activity as a result of the			? There was Response to		•		
Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailabl	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling			\boxtimes				
Economic support							
Funeral arrangements	\boxtimes						
Housing assistance							
Mental health services							
Foster care							
Health care							
T 1							
Legal services							

NY-21-097 FINAL Page 8 of 11

NEW YORK STATE and Family Services	View YORK Office of Children and Family Services Child Fatality Report						
and Family Services	Ciliu	T atami	y Keport				
Homemaking Services							
Parenting Skills							
Domestic Violence Services							
Early Intervention							
Alcohol/Substance abuse						\boxtimes	
Child Care				\boxtimes			
Intensive case management							
Family or others as safety resources							
Other							
Other, specify: ACS delivered food and a	bed	•				1	
Additional information, if necessary: On 9/2/21, the MA and MU agreed to the I ACS delivered food and a bed for the fami	, ,	ement Prog	gram with a	service pro	vider agency	7.	
their well-being in response to the fatalit Explain: The service provider explained their prograp psychotherapy, play therapy, coping skills, bereavement services for the BM. ACS prowided to parent(s) and fatality? Yes Explain: The MA was referred for child-parent psycprogram. ACS also provided food for the fatality.	am would we and parentic vided the factorial other care hotherapy, pamily.	ng. The Mamily with a givers to a play therapy	A agreed to a bed. ddress any y, coping sk	immediate	n. ACS was	attempting	
	History	Prior to t	he Fatality	У			
	C	hild Informa	ation				
Did the child have a history of alleged ch Was the child ever placed outside of the Were there any siblings ever placed outs Was the child acutely ill during the two	home prior ide of the h	to the dea nome prior	th?	d's death?		Yes No N/A No	
	Infants	Under One	Year Old				

During pregnancy, mother:

Had medical complications / infections

Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs

Experienced domestic violence

Used illicit drugs

NY-21-097 FINAL Page 9 of 11



Was not	noted in the case record to have a	ny of the issues listed					
Infant was ☐ Drug ex ☐ With ne		ase record	☐ With fetal alcoh	ol effects or	syndrome		
	CPS - Investigativ	ve History Three Years	Prior to the Fatalit	ty			
Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)		
08/27/2021	Deceased Child, Female, 11 Months	Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending	No		
	Deceased Child, Female, 11 Months	Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Years	Lack of Supervision	Pending			
	Other Child - cousin, Female, 3 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending			
	Other Child - cousin, Female, 3 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Female, 24 Years	Lack of Supervision	Pending			
Report Summary: The 8/27/21 SCR report alleged the aunt was aware the 3-yo cousin and the subject child required a higher level of supervision. Despite this knowledge on 8/27/21, the aunt was showering the children and for approximately five minutes, the aunt left the 3-yo and the subject child unsupervised in the bathtub to go get towels. When she returned, the aunt found the subject child floating face up. She was purple in color with food in her mouth. The aunt rushed the subject child to the nearest hospital which was approximately three blocks from the home. The child had a pulse but was not breathing. Report Determination: Undetermined OCFS Review Results: The report was initiated within the required time frames. Contact was made with the family and with the hospital where the child was taken for treatment. The appropriate notifications were provided. There was evidence of supervisory involvement and a safety plan was implemented to control the situation and protect the 3-yo child. Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes							
	CPS - Investigative	History More Than Three Ye	ears Prior to the Fatality				
There was no CPS investigative history more than three years prior to the fatality. Known CPS History Outside of NYS							
There was n	o known CPS History outside of I	NYS.					

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality



Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Recommended Action(s)	
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No	
Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No	