



Report Identification Number: BU-19-037

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Dec 31, 2019

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:

- A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
- The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
- The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
- The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child’s family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child’s death; whether the child or the child’s family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child’s death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child’s death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child’s household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may **only** be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. **It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child’s siblings or other children in the household.**

OCFS’ review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS’ assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships		
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult	
Contacts		
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
Dr.-Doctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPS-Child Protective Services		
Allegations		
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other	
Miscellaneous		
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social Service	ACS-Administration for Children's Services	NYPD-New York City Police Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation		



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased
Age: 10 day(s)

Jurisdiction: Erie
Gender: Male

Date of Death: 10/05/2019
Initial Date OCFS Notified: 10/05/2019

Presenting Information

An SCR report was received on 10/5/2019. The report alleged that on that day, the 10-day-old subject child was found cold and unresponsive in the bed of his parents. The parents called the police and they arrived and performed CPR with no success, the death of the child was pronounced at 6:35AM. The subject child was not known to have any preexisting medical conditions and was free of injuries.

Executive Summary

This report concerns the death of the 10-day-old subject child. Erie County Department of Social Services (ECDSS) received an SCR report regarding the death on 10/5/19. The death was considered suspicious because the child was healthy and had no known medical concerns. The child lived at home with his mother and father and had no siblings.

On 10/5/19, the mother woke to find the child unresponsive. The child was laying in the parents' bed, positioned between the mother and father. The mother and father admitted that they regularly co-slept with the child despite having received education about safe sleep practices. After discovering the child under the comforter, the mother woke the father and they then called a family member and 911. The mother administered CPR until first responders arrived and they took over life saving efforts. EMS quickly realized the child showed no signs of life and his death was declared at the home.

The ME was notified and performed an autopsy. The ME told ECDSS she believed the child may have been lying on his stomach due to the lividity found on his face and chest. The ME noted the child appeared well cared for and had no marks or bruises. The ME also discovered the child had a physiological abnormality that may have contributed or caused the child's death, but was awaiting further test results before making a final conclusion. Therefore, the final report was not yet completed at the time of this writing and the cause and manner of death were not yet determined.

LE investigated and shared information freely with ECDSS. LE did not suspect any criminality surrounding the death and closed their investigation.

Throughout the investigation ECDSS spoke with all first responders, the pediatrician and family members. There were no concerns regarding the care the mother and father provided the child. ECDSS provided the family with referrals for mental health crisis services, grief counseling and bereavement support services.

ECDSS substantiated the allegations of DOA/Fatality and IG against the mother and father regarding the child's death. ECDSS based the determination on the evidence gathered during the investigation, which indicated the parents failed to exercise a minimum degree of care by placing the child in an unsafe sleep environment. Additionally, ECDSS cited conversations with the ME in their investigation conclusion, as the ME suggested the child was likely found face down in the bed based on the lividity pattern.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:



- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:

- Safety assessment due at the time of determination? N/A

Determination:

- Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation? Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
- Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate? Yes

Explain:

There was no requirement to complete safety assessments because there were no surviving children in the home.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate? Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements? Yes

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation? Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.

Explain:

It was appropriate for ECDSS to conclude the investigation.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Incident Information

Date of Death: 10/05/2019

Time of Death: Unknown

Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death: Unknown

County where fatality incident occurred: Erie

Was 911 or local emergency number called? Yes

Time of Call: Unknown

Did EMS respond to the scene? Yes

At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? No

Child's activity at time of incident:

- Sleeping
- Working
- Driving / Vehicle occupant
- Playing
- Eating
- Unknown
- Other



Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? Yes

At time of incident supervisor was:

- Drug Impaired
- Alcohol Impaired
- Distracted
- Impaired by disability
- Absent
- Asleep
- Impaired by illness
- Other:

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1
Adults: 0

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	10 Day(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	21 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	25 Year(s)

LDSS Response

ECDSS received the SCR report regarding the child's death and immediately notified the district attorney and coordinated their investigative efforts with law enforcement. ECDSS contacted the source of the report and performed a CPS history search for the mother, father and subject child.

ECDSS went to the case address and walked through the home with law enforcement. The medical examiner was also at the home, preparing to transport the subject child for an autopsy. ECDSS observed a crib and provisions for the child and also noted there were sheets, a pillow and a thick comforter on the parents bed where the child was found unresponsive. ECDSS then interviewed the mother and father regarding the events leading up to the death.

The father reported the child, the mother and himself went to sleep around 1AM on 10/5/19. The child was positioned in between the parents on their bed. The father woke at about 3AM and placed his hand on the child's chest and verified the child was breathing. The father said he was then woken by the mother at 6AM when she found the child unresponsive. The father said the mother told him she had last seen the child alive between 3 and 4AM when the child woke crying. The father told ECDSS that 911 was called and the mother followed their instructions and performed CPR on the child, while the father went outside to wait for first responders and direct them to the home. The mother described the same events as the father, but did not recall what time she woke with the child during the night. She stated he was crying and she picked him up to comfort him and then placed him on the bed again, positioned on his back. The mother explained that the baby was positioned higher on the bed, close to the head board and denied he had the comforter on him. When the mother woke around 6AM, the comforter was over the child and she pulled it back and found him laying on his back lifeless. The mother described the child as cold to the touch and pale in color. The mother woke the father and they began patting the child on his back because they thought he may have had something stuck in his throat. Nothing came from the child's mouth and the parents then called the maternal grandmother, who in turn advised them to call 911. The mother called 911 and began CPR until first responders arrived. The parents stated the child always slept in their bed because he cried constantly when in the crib and they could not get any sleep.

ECDSS spoke with the first responders and learned that law enforcement arrived at the home and took over CPR efforts from the mother. When EMS arrived, the child had no signs of life and the coroner was contacted. First responders denied



any concerns of drug or alcohol use by the parents and described the home as well kept.

The pediatrician was contacted and expressed no concerns for the care the parents provided the infant. The infant had been to the doctor twice since birth and there were no health concerns noted. The pediatrician provided the parents with safe sleep education. ECDSS also reviewed the child's birth records and all medical assessments yielded normal findings.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Pending

Primary Cause of Death: Undetermined if injury or medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? Yes

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
052249 - Deceased Child, Male, 10 Days	052250 - Mother, Female, 25 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
052249 - Deceased Child, Male, 10 Days	052251 - Father, Male, 21 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
052249 - Deceased Child, Male, 10 Days	052250 - Mother, Female, 25 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated
052249 - Deceased Child, Male, 10 Days	052251 - Father, Male, 21 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contact with source?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>



Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Economic support	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Funeral arrangements	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Housing assistance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mental health services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Foster care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Health care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Legal services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family planning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Homemaking Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Parenting Skills	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Domestic Violence Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Early Intervention	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alcohol/Substance abuse	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Child Care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intensive case management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family or others as safety resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>



Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

The parents and maternal grandmother were offered referrals for grief counseling services.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information

- Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? No
- Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? No
- Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? No
- Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death? No

Infants Under One Year Old

During pregnancy, mother:

- Had medical complications / infections
- Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs
- Experienced domestic violence
- Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed
- Had heavy alcohol use
- Smoked tobacco
- Used illicit drugs

Infant was born:

- Drug exposed
- With neither of the issues listed noted in case record
- With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the fatality.

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS history more than 3 years prior to the fatality.

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There is no known CPS history outside of New York State.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality



Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Additional Local District Comments

We at the Erie County Department of Social Services appreciate the opportunity given us to review the draft report in advance. We find that the facts, as written, describe the unfortunate events and the actions taken in response. We are pleased that OCFS found that the fatality investigation was conducted appropriately and that there are no required actions related to the fatality.

Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No