

Report Identification Number: BU-17-020

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Dec 28, 2017

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns: A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships							
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child					
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child					
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father					
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider					
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father					
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle					
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub					
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult						
	Contacts						
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner					
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services					
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother					
CPS-Child Protective Services							
	Allegations						
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts					
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding					
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse					
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect					
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive					
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision					
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other						
	Miscellaneous						
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender					
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence					
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police					
Service	Services	Department					
PPRS-Purchased Preventive	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy	FC-Foster Care					
Rehabilitative Services	Families						
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services					
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan					
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment					
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old					
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation							



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Orleans **Date of Death:** 07/29/2017

Age: 11 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 08/01/2017

Presenting Information

On 7/31/17, the Orleans County Department of Social Services (OCDSS) received an SCR report regarding the death of the 11-month-old male SC. The report alleged on 7/28/2017, the SC was being cared for by the parent substitute (PS). The PS was giving the SC a bath in the tub and the SC slipped and hit his head on the faucet of the bathtub, then the SC slipped out of PS's hands and fell again hitting his head on the side of the tub. There was a delay in treatment as the PS waited a half hour before calling the BM at work to inform her of the SC's injuries. The BM went home, which took about 20 minutes, and after seeing the condition of the SC called 911. When LE arrived the SC was noted to have bruising to his cheek and ear. The SC was transported to Strong Memorial Hospital where it was determined that he had a skull fracture with brain bleeding. It was determined that the injuries sustained were inconsistent with the explanation given by the PS. The SC died on 7/29/17 at 8 PM.

Executive Summary

On 7/31/17 OCDSS received an SCR report regarding the death of the 11-month-old SC. There was an open CPS investigation, which was initiated on 7/28/17, when the SC sustained life threatening injuries and it was alleged the explanation provided by the PS did not match the severity of the injuries.

On 7/28/17, the SC sustained multiple injuries while in the sole care of the PS while the BM was at work and the 4 yo SS was watching TV in the home. PS called and informed the BM that the SC fell in the tub and BM returned home from work and told the PS to call 911. The SC was transported via ambulance to the Strong Memorial Hospital. The SC remained on life support in the Pediatric Intensive Care Unit until 7/29/17 when it was determined the SC was not going to recover from his injuries. Life support was withdrawn and the SC died at 8 PM.

LE, the DA and the ME were notified and ME performed an autopsy. The cause and manner of death were pending the final autopsy report and findings. OCDSS investigated the report jointly with LE. At the time of the writing of this report, no arrests had been made and the LE investigation remained open, pending the final autopsy report.

OCDSS interviewed the BM, BF and his partner, the PS, and PS's wife. OCDSS also interviewed the PS's 6 yo child and attempted to interview the 4 yo SS, although he was non-verbal due to a developmental delay. OCDSS assessed the safety of the 4 yo SS and BF's child with his partner (8-month-old SS), as well as the PS's 2 CHN, ages 6 yo and 7 months old. The 4 yo and 8-month-old SS were assessed to be safe in BF's care and the PS's CHN were assessed to be safe in their mother's (PS's wife's) care. A safety plan was initiated that the PS would not have contact with the 4 yo SS or PS's CHN. Since the BM was unwilling to have the PS leave her home during the investigation, an additional safety plan was initiated that the 4 yo SS would stay with the BF and the BM was only allowed supervised contact. The BF later applied for and was granted temporary custody of the 4 yo SS with an OP issued against the PS which barred him from all contact with the SS and BF. OCDSS referred the 4 yo SS for a full nuclear scan to assess for injuries, and a healing corner fracture on the right proximal tibia was discovered and estimated to have occurred within the last 6 weeks. OCDSS was unable to establish how the injury occurred or who the caretaker of the SS was at the time the injury occurred.

OCDSS contacted the pediatrician, doctors from the hospital, EMS and the ME's office. It was learned the SC had no known pre-existing medical condition and the SC sustained injuries while in the sole care of the PS while the 4 yo was in the home. The PS delayed in obtaining medical care for the SC for at least half an hour. The doctor stated the PS's explanation for the injuries was not consistent with the severity of the injuries the SC sustained. It was confirmed the SC

BU-17-020 FINAL Page 3 of 12



had the following head injuries: subdural bleed, skull fracture, mid-line shift to the skull, left side brain bleed, and right side brain trauma. It was also noted the SC had bruising on his hip, calf, nose, ears and forehead. The cause of the injuries had not been determined and further testing was being conducted to determine the extent of the SC's injuries.

OCDSS spoke with multiple collaterals and worked collaboratively with members of their multidisciplinary team to conduct a thorough investigation. OCDSS offered bereavement/counseling services to the BM, BF and SS, although these services were declined. The PS was already engaged in MH counseling and was going to continue to attend. At the time of the writing of this report, OCDSS had not yet made a determination regarding the allegations in the investigation and were awaiting the final autopsy report.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fa	tality
Safety Assessment: Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the	
• Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:	
 Approved Initial Safety Assessment? 	Yes
 Safety assessment due at the time of determination? 	N/A
Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropria	te? Yes
 Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegate as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation? 	ions N/A
 Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate? 	N/A
Explain: The case remained open for investigation.	
Was the decision to close the case appropriate?	N/A
Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements?	Yes
Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?	Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.
Explain: The case remained open for investigation.	
Required Actions Related to the Fatality	

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

BU-17-020 FINAL Page 4 of 12



Incident Information

Date of Death: 07/29/2017	Time of Death: 08:00 PM
Date of fatal incident, if different than date of death:	07/28/2017
Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death:	Unknown
County where fatality incident occurred:	Orleans
Was 911 or local emergency number called?	Yes
Time of Call:	Unknown
Did EMS respond to the scene?	Yes
At time of incident leading to death, had child used alc	ohol or drugs? No
Child's activity at time of incident:	
☐ Sleeping ☐ Working	Driving / Vehicle occupant
☐ Playing ☐ Eating	Unknown
Other: Bathing	
Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to Is the caretaker listed in the Household Composition? At time of incident supervisor was: Not impaired.	

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1
Adults: 0

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	11 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	No Role	Female	23 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother's Partner	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	27 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	4 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Father	No Role	Male	24 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Father's Partner	No Role	Female	22 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Sibling	No Role	Female	8 Month(s)
Other Household 2	Other Adult - PS's Wife	No Role	Female	25 Year(s)
Other Household 2	Other Child - PS's Child	No Role	Female	7 Month(s)
Other Household 2	Other Child - PS's Child	No Role	Female	6 Year(s)

LDSS Response

OCDSS began investigating the injuries to the SC upon receipt of the SCR report on 7/28/17 and began investigating the death of the SC after he passed away on 7/29/17. OCDSS conducted a joint investigation with LE.

BM reported BF had the CHN for an overnight visit 3 days per week. On 7/26/17 BF brought the SC to the pediatrician BU-17-020 FINAL Page 5 of 12



and there were no concerns. On 7/27/17, BM put the CHN to bed at 9PM and the SC had no marks or bruises. On 7/28/17, BM checked on the CHN before she left for work at 6:30 AM; both CHN were sleeping. At 12:15 PM PS called her and said there had been an accident and the SC fell in the bathtub. PS told her he thought an ambulance should be called because the SC was "seizuring" but he wanted BM to decide. BM left work at 12:20 PM and drove home, arriving at 12:40 PM. The SS was watching TV in the living room. The SC's eyes were half open and he was making "whimpering" noises. BM told the PS to call 911. The ambulance arrived and transported the BM and SC to the hospital. The PGM went to the home and picked up the SS. BM stated PS gave the SS a bath once per week. Although the SS had no official diagnosis, it was noted that he had a developmental delay, and only occasionally spoke words on his own. BM stated since February 2017 PS cared for the CHN every Friday while she worked and she had no concerns. Though it was suggested, she refused to have PS leave the home while the incident was investigated.

BF stated he didn't think the PS was telling the entire truth about the incident. The last time he saw the SC was the morning of 7/27/17 and the SC was free from marks and bruises. A safety plan was initiated that the SS would stay with BF, PS would have no contact with the SS, and BM was only allowed supervised contact with the SS.

PS was interviewed by LE on 7/28/17 and a re-enactment was conducted at the home with the PS, OCDSS and LE on 8/1/17. PS confirmed he gave the SC a bath around 10:15 AM. The SC was standing up in the tub holding onto the his fingers when the SC fell forward, hitting his face on the side of the tub, and inhaled water. He picked the SC up, dropped him, and then the SC hit his head on the faucet. The SC's breathing got shallow so he gave him a "rescue breath". He patted the SC's back and he spit up water. He put the SC's diaper and pajamas on and the SC "started convulsing and breathing not rhythmic". He went outside to smoke a cigarette and he put the SC in his crib with frozen mangos on his head. He called the BM at 12:15 PM. He reported a half hour had lapsed from the time of the incident to the time 911 was called. PS reported that he had MH issues, was on medication and was attending MH counseling.

BF's home was assessed to be safe. BF's partner was interviewed and their child (8-month-old SS) and the 4 yo SS were assessed to be safe in BF and his partner's care. On 8/2/17, BF received custody of the 4 yo SS and an OP was issued against the PS barring all contact with the SS and BF. Attempts were made to interview the 4 yo SS, although were unsuccessful due to his delays. The 4 yo SS was assessed medically for injuries and when one was found, OCDSS attempted to discern the cause of the injury but was unable to establish how the injury occurred.

PS's wife was interviewed. She stated that PS was a good father and denied that he was violent toward her CHN. She said he had not visited the CHN in a month. Her home was assessed to be safe and the CHN, ages 6 yo and 7 months, were assessed to be safe in her care. The 6 yo was interviewed and nothing of concern was shared. A safety plan was initiated that PS would not have contact with his CHN and PS's wife applied for custody.

At the time of the writing of this report, the LE investigation and the CPS investigation remained open, pending the results of the final autopsy report.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Pending

Primary Cause of Death: Unknown

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?No

Comments: Orleans County does not have an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team.

BU-17-020 FINAL Page 6 of 12



SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
042921 - Deceased Child, Male, 11 Mons	042924 - Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Pending
042921 - Deceased Child, Male, 11 Mons	042924 - Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending
042921 - Deceased Child, Male, 11 Mons	042924 - Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Year(s)	Internal Injuries	Pending
042921 - Deceased Child, Male, 11 Mons	042924 - Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Pending
042921 - Deceased Child, Male, 11 Mons	042924 - Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Year(s)	Fractures	Pending

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	\boxtimes			
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	\boxtimes			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
Contact with source?	\boxtimes			
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	\boxtimes			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	\boxtimes			
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	\boxtimes			
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	\boxtimes			
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?				

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine			
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?							
Was there an adequate safety assessment of impending or immediate danger to surviving siblings/other children in the household named in the report:							
Within 24 hours?	\boxtimes						
At 7 days?	\boxtimes						

BU-17-020 FINAL Page 7 of 12



At 30 days?				
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?				
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?		\boxtimes		
When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?	\boxtimes			
Explain: No safety factors were chosen on the 30-day safety assessment dated 8/29/17. there were safety plans/controlling interventions in place to protect the SS and place that the BM was only allowed to have supervised visitation with the SS a Court barring the PS from the SS. There was a safety plan in place with the PS contact with his CHN.	PS's CHN and there v	V. There www.was an OF	as a safet issued in	y plan in Family
Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment	Profile			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	\boxtimes			
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?				
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	\boxtimes			
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?		\boxtimes		
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case				
Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality In	nvestigatio	n		
- Income and a second control of the second	a v es er gwere			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?				
Were there surviving children in the household that were removed either as a result of this fatality report / investigation or for reasons unrelated to this fatality?				
Explain as necessary: The need for DV services was not explored with the family and there was a do adults.	cumented	history of	DV betw	reen all of the



Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? ☐ Family Court ☐ Criminal Court ☐ Court ☐ Criminal Court ☐ Criminal Court ☐ Court ☐ Court ☐ Court ☐ Criminal Court ☐ Court

Have any Orders of Protection been issued? Yes	
From: 08/02/2017	To: Unknown
Explain: An OP was issued by the Orleans County Family Court Judg	e barring the PS from the SS and BF.

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling							
Economic support						\boxtimes	
Funeral arrangements							
Housing assistance							
Mental health services		\boxtimes					
Foster care						\boxtimes	
Health care						\boxtimes	
Legal services						\boxtimes	
Family planning		\boxtimes					
Homemaking Services							
Parenting Skills				\boxtimes			
Domestic Violence Services		\boxtimes					
Early Intervention							
Alcohol/Substance abuse							
Child Care						\boxtimes	
Intensive case management							
DI 4 - 040		EDES 1 4 E				D 0	0.10

BU-17-020 FINAL Page 9 of 12

New YORK STATE and Family Services	Child	Fatality	Report	t			
Family or others as safety resources							
Other						\boxtimes	
Additional information, if necessary: Parenting skills services were not offered to services were offered to the family and refurefused. Burial assistance was provided by drug testing.	ised. DV sei	rvices and	family planı	ning servic	es were offer	red to BM ar	nd she
Were services provided to siblings or oth their well-being in response to the fatality Explain: The SS received a full nuclear scan to check received. The PS's CHN were assessed to have were services provided to parent(s) and fatality? Yes Explain:	y? Yes k for injurie ave no servi	s. Follow u	p medical c	are was in	itiated when	the results w	
Burial assistance was provided to the BM a although they refused this service.	nd BF. Bere	eavement/c	ounseling se	ervices wei	re offered to	the BM and	BF,
	History I	Prior to tl	ne Fatality	y			
	Cr	ild Informa	ition				
Did the child have a history of alleged ch Was there an open CPS case with this ch Was the child ever placed outside of the Were there any siblings ever placed outsi Was the child acutely ill during the two v	ild at the ti home prior ide of the h	me of deat to the dea ome prior	h? th?	d's death?		Yes Yes No No	
	Infants	Under One	Year Old				
During pregnancy, mother: Had medical complications / infections Misused over-the-counter or prescriptio Experienced domestic violence	n drugs			Smoked	vy alcohol us tobacco icit drugs	se	

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed

With neither of the issues listed noted in case record

Infant was born:

Drug exposed

BU-17-020 FINAL Page 10 of 12

With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome



Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
07/28/2017	Deceased Child, Male, 11 Months	Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Years	Fractures	Pending	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 11 Months	Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending	
	Deceased Child, Male, 11 Months	Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Years	Internal Injuries	Pending	
	Sibling, Male, 4 Years	Father, Male, 24 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Pending	
	·	Mother's Partner, Male, 27 Years	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Pending	
	Sibling, Male, 4 Years	Father, Male, 24 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending	

Report Summary:

The SCR report alleged while in the care of the PS on 7/28/17, the SC sustained a subdural bleed, skull fracture, a midline shift to the skull, a left side brain bleed, trauma to the right side of the brain and a bruised hip, calf, nose, ears and forehead. The explanation of the injuries did not match the severity of the injuries. Subsequent SCR report received 9/13/17 with allegations that the BF used marijuana while caring for the 4 yo SS.

Determination: Undetermined

OCFS Review Results:

OCDSS conducted a thorough, joint investigation with LE into the SC's injuries and subsequent death. The subjects and family members were interviewed, appropriate collateral contacts were made and necessary documentation was gathered and reviewed. The SS and PS's children were assessed for safety and appropriate safety plans were initiated and maintained throughout the case. OCDSS referred the BF and his partner for substance abuse services for drug testing when they admitted to marijuana use. The investigation remained open pending final autopsy results.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS history more than years prior to the fatality.

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There is no known CPS history outside of New York State.

Casework Contacts

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
--	-----	----	-----	---------------------



Were face-to-face contacts with the child in the child's placem made with the required frequency?	nent location								
Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality									
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? ☐ Family Court ☐ Criminal Court ☐ Order of Protection									
Have any Orders of Protection been issued? Yes									
From: 07/19/2017 To:	To: Unknown								
Explain: An OP was issued on 7/19/17 against PS requiring he refrain from effect.	m offensive con	nduct aga	inst PS's v	wife and w	as still in				
From: 02/23/2017 To:	: Unknown								
Explain: An OP was issued on 2/23/17 against BF requiring that he refrain from offensive conduct toward BM and was still in effect.									
Recommended Action(s)									
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No									
Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No									

BU-17-020 FINAL Page 12 of 12