

Report Identification Number: AL-19-026

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Jan 27, 2020

| This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns: ☐ A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child. |
|---|
| The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case. |
| The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency. |
| The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case. |

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

| Relationships | | | | | |
|--|---|---------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| BM-Biological Mother | SM-Subject Mother | SC-Subject Child | | | |
| BF-Biological Father | SF-Subject Father | OC-Other Child | | | |
| MGM-Maternal Grand Mother | MGF-Maternal Grand Father | FF-Foster Father | | | |
| PGM-Paternal Grand Mother | PGF-Paternal Grand Father | DCP-Day Care Provider | | | |
| MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother | MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father | PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father | | | |
| PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother | MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle | PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle | | | |
| FM-Foster Mother | SS-Surviving Sibling | PS-Parent Sub | | | |
| CH/CHN-Child/Children | OA-Other Adult | | | | |
| | Contacts | | | | |
| LE-Law Enforcement | CW-Case Worker | CP-Case Planner | | | |
| DrDoctor | ME-Medical Examiner | EMS-Emergency Medical Services | | | |
| DC-Day Care | FD-Fire Department | BM-Biological Mother | | | |
| CPS-Child Protective Services | | | | | |
| | Allegations | | | | |
| FX-Fractures | II-Internal Injuries | L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts | | | |
| S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains | C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking | B/S-Burns/Scalding | | | |
| P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance | XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment | PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse | | | |
| CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use | LMC-Lack of Medical Care | EdN-Educational Neglect | | | |
| EN-Emotional Neglect | SA-Sexual Abuse | M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive | | | |
| IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter | IG-Inadequate Guardianship | LS-Lack of Supervision | | | |
| Ab-Abandonment | OTH/COI-Other | | | | |
| | Miscellaneous | | | | |
| IND-Indicated | UNF-Unfounded | SO-Sexual Offender | | | |
| Sub-Substantiated | Unsub-Unsubstantiated | DV-Domestic Violence | | | |
| LDSS-Local Department of Social | ACS-Administration for Children's | NYPD-New York City Police | | | |
| Service | Services | Department | | | |
| PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services | TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families | FC-Foster Care | | | |
| MH-Mental Health | ER-Emergency Room | COS-Court Ordered Services | | | |
| OP-Order of Protection | RAP-Risk Assessment Profile | FASP-Family Assessment Plan | | | |
| FAR-Family Assessment Response | Hx-History | Tx-Treatment | | | |
| CAC-Child Advocacy Center | PIP-Program Improvement Plan | yo- year(s) old | | | |
| CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation | | | | | |



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased Jurisdiction: Washington Date of Death: 08/07/2019

Age: 9 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 08/07/2019

Presenting Information

An SCR report alleged on 8/7/19, the nine-month-old subject infant passed away in the home, while in the care of the mother and father. The infant had no known medical condition and the circumstances surrounding the death were unknown. A subsequent report was received on 9/11/19 regarding the death of the infant and alleged the parents used drugs on the night of the incident after putting the children to bed. It additionally alleged on 9/9/19, the mother was in the bathroom using drugs and left the children unsupervised. The oldest sibling was locked out of the home and had to gain entry through a window. The parents abused drugs on a daily basis and the maternal grandfather abused alcohol while caring for the children.

Executive Summary

On 8/7/19, the Washington County Department of Social Services (WCDSS) received on SCR report regarding the death of the nine-month-old male subject infant. At the time of the infant's death, there was an open Preventive Services case, which was opened on 4/9/18. There was a pending Article 10 Neglect Petition that was filed on 5/13/19, due to the parent's history of drug use and domestic violence, and they were minimally cooperative with service providers. The one-year-old sibling and twin nine-month-old sibling resided with the mother. The father of the twins did not reside in the home, although he was in the home on the night of the incident. The 11-year-old sibling was in the custody of the maternal grandfather since 2013, when there was a prior finding of Neglect against the mother and sibling's father. The 11-year-old sibling had regular visitation with her father.

The investigation revealed on 8/6/19 around 9:00 PM, the mother and father put the one-year-old sibling to bed in a portable crib in their bedroom and swaddled the twin nine-month-old infants and put them to bed in inclined sleepers in a separate bedroom. The parents did not check on the twins until 8/7/19 at approximately 12:50 PM, when they heard the twin sibling crying. The father found the subject infant still swaddled on his back and unresponsive. He called 911 at 12:59 PM and performed CPR until first responders arrived. The infant was transported via ambulance to the hospital and he was pronounced deceased upon arrival.

An autopsy was performed, and the final autopsy report had not been received at the time this report was written. The law enforcement investigation remained open pending the autopsy results and no charges had been filed.

The twin infants were born premature at 26 weeks gestation and had multiple health ailments as a result, including lung issues. The subject infant's medical issues were more severe. The mother was enrolled in medication assisted therapy and substance abuse treatment and she was at risk of being discharged due to non-compliance. The father was not enrolled in substance abuse treatment and admitted to regular marijuana use. Both parents denied using drugs on the night of the incident.

After the infant's death, the parents violated a court order that they were required to be supervised with the siblings and there were ongoing concerns for the parent's drug use. The twin sibling and one-year-old sibling were removed and placed in Foster Care on 9/13/19. On 11/15/19, the two siblings were moved to the paternal grandmother's home. The 11-year-old sibling remained in the maternal grandfather's custody.

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation and contacted all necessary collaterals. The allegations of Inadequate Guardianship and Parent's Drug/Alcohol Misuse were appropriately substantiated against the parents regarding all four



children. The parents did not check on the twin infants for around 16 hours despite knowing the infant's medical needs. There were ongoing concerns for the parent's drug use and not complying with treatment recommendations. The allegation of DOA/Fatality was unsubstantiated as the infant's cause and manner of death had not been determined and it was unknown if the parent's actions or inactions caused the infant's death. Allegations against the maternal grandfather were unsubstantiated as it was determined the grandfather's alcohol use did not have a negative impact on the children. The parents were provided with burial assistance and offered grief counseling and mental health counseling and the case remained open for Preventive Services.

PIP Requirement

This review resulted in a citation related to casework practice. In response, WCDSS will submit a PIP to the Regional Office within 30 days of receipt of this report. The PIP will identify what action(s) the WCDSS has taken, or will take, to address the cited issue(s). For citations where a PIP is currently implemented, WCDSS will review the plan(s) and revise as needed.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

 Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:

O Approved Initial Safety Assessment?
Yes

Safety assessment due at the time of determination? Yes

• Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment Yes appropriate?

Determination:

 Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation? Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.

• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?

Yes

Explain:

The case was appropriately indicated and remained opened for ongoing CPS.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate? N/A

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory Yes or regulatory requirements?

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation? Yes, the case record has detail of the

consultation.

Explain:

Casework activity was commensurate with best casework practice.

| Required Actions Related to the Fatality | | | | |
|--|-------|--------------|--|--|
| AL-19-026 | FINAL | Page 4 of 19 | | |



Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities Incident Information Date of Death: 08/07/2019 Time of Death: Unknown Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death: Unknown County where fatality incident occurred: Washington Was 911 or local emergency number called? Yes Time of Call: 12:59 PM Did EMS respond to the scene? Yes At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? No Child's activity at time of incident: Sleeping Working Driving / Vehicle occupant M Unknown Playing Eating Other Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? Yes How long before incident was the child last seen by caretaker? 16 Hours At time of incident supervisor was: Drug Impaired Absent Alcohol Impaired X Asleep Impaired by illness Distracted Other: Impaired by disability

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1

Adults: 0

Household Composition at time of Fatality

| Household | Relationship | Role | Gender | Age |
|----------------------------|--|---------------------|--------|------------|
| Deceased Child's Household | Deceased Child | Alleged Victim | Male | 9 Month(s) |
| Deceased Child's Household | Mother | Alleged Perpetrator | Female | 31 Year(s) |
| Deceased Child's Household | Sibling | Alleged Victim | Female | 1 Year(s) |
| Deceased Child's Household | Sibling | Alleged Victim | Female | 9 Month(s) |
| Other Household 1 | Grandparent | Alleged Perpetrator | Male | 65 Year(s) |
| Other Household 1 | Sibling | Alleged Victim | Female | 11 Year(s) |
| Other Household 2 | Other Adult - 11-year-old Sibling's Father | No Role | Male | 40 Year(s) |
| Other Household 3 | Father | Alleged Perpetrator | Male | 31 Year(s) |

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 5 of 19



LDSS Response

Upon receipt of the SCR report, WCDSS searched SCR history and spoke to the source of the report, EMS, and law enforcement. First responders said the infant had no apparent injuries and there were no signs of trauma. The infant was on the floor in the bedroom at the time of their arrival and he appeared deceased with rigor mortis already setting in. WCDSS met with the mother and father at the police barracks, then assessed the siblings to be safe at a maternal aunt's home.

Through interviews with the mother and father it was learned that they fed the twins a bottle on the night of 8/6/19, then swaddled them with adult fleece blankets and placed them in separate "Rock N Play" inclined sleepers at 9:00 PM. The 11-year-old sibling was at the grandfather's home and the one-year-old sibling was sleeping in a portable crib in the parent's bedroom. The parents said the three children slept through the night. When the parents woke up the following morning about 11:00 AM, the father went to the store and the mother fed the one-year-old sibling. After the father returned home, the parents heard the twin sibling crying. The father went into the bedroom and brought the twin sibling to the mother. He then returned to the bedroom to get the subject infant and he realized the infant was cold and unresponsive. The father yelled for the mother, then he called 911 and performed CPR on the infant on the bedroom floor.

WCDSS provided safe sleep education to the parents on numerous occasions during the open Preventive Services case and during previous CPS investigations. The parents reported they were aware of safe sleep guidelines, but felt the twins slept better in the inclined sleeper and hospital staff had advised them at the time of the twin's birth that they should swaddle them.

The parents were provided with an abundance of services through the open Preventive Services case and they were non-compliant with substance abuse services, continued to have verbal and physical altercations in the presence of the children and they had not engaged in court-ordered Intensive Services. WCDSS filed a Neglect Petition to obtain court-ordered services and the petition was pending in Family Court at the time of the infant's death. Following his death, WCDSS appropriately initiated a safety plan, then obtained a court order that the parents were required to be supervised with the siblings. Throughout the investigation, WCDSS assessed the ongoing safety of the siblings and closely monitored the parent's compliance with drug treatment and their court orders. The mother did not complete a hair follicle test as ordered and she tested positive for nonprescribed drugs and the father admitted to continued use of marijuana. WCDSS became aware that the mother was unsupervised with the siblings on several occasions, resulting in the removal of the twin sibling and one-year-old sibling and their placement in Foster Care. The grandfather's home and the home of the 11-year-old sibling's father were assessed and it was determined the oldest sibling was safe in the continued custody of the maternal grandfather.

WCDSS obtained the children's pediatrician records, which noted the subject infant's medical issues due to prematurity. The records noted the infant was last seen on 6/12/19, and he was in good health at that time.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Pending

Primary Cause of Death: Undetermined if injury or medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Other physician

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?No

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 6 of 19



Comments: Washington County does not have an OCFS-approved Child Fatality Review Team.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

| Alleged Victim(s) | Alleged Perpetrator(s) | Allegation(s) | Allegation Outcome |
|--|---|----------------------------------|-----------------------|
| 052785 - Deceased Child, Male, 9 Mons | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | DOA / Fatality | Unsubstantiated |
| 052785 - Deceased Child, Male, 9 Mons | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| 052785 - Deceased Child, Male, 9 Mons | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| 052785 - Deceased Child, Male, 9 Mons | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | DOA / Fatality | Unsubstantiated |
| 052785 - Deceased Child, Male, 9 Mons | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| 052785 - Deceased Child, Male, 9 Mons | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| 052787 - Sibling, Female, 9 Month(s) | 052789 - Grandparent, Male, 65 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated |
| 052787 - Sibling, Female, 9 Month(s) | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| 052787 - Sibling, Female, 9 Month(s) | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| 052787 - Sibling, Female, 9 Month(s) | 052789 - Grandparent, Male, 65 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated |
| 052787 - Sibling, Female, 9 Month(s) | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| 052787 - Sibling, Female, 9 Month(s) | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| 052788 - Sibling, Female, 1 Year(s) | 052789 - Grandparent, Male, 65 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated |
| 052788 - Sibling, Female, 1 Year(s) | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| 052788 - Sibling, Female, 1 Year(s) | 052789 - Grandparent, Male, 65 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated |
| 052788 - Sibling, Female, 1 Year(s) | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Lack of Supervision | Substantiated |
| 052788 - Sibling, Female, 1 Year(s) | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| 052788 - Sibling, Female, 1 Year(s) | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| 052788 - Sibling, Female, 1 Year(s) | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| 052790 - Sibling, Female, 11 Year(s) | 052789 - Grandparent, Male, 65 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated |

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 7 of 19

| 2 | NEW YORK STATE | Office of Children and Family Services |
|---|----------------------|--|
|---|----------------------|--|

| 052790 - Sibling, Female, 11 Year(s) | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated |
|---|---|----------------------------------|-----------------|
| 052790 - Sibling, Female, 11 Year(s) | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| 052790 - Sibling, Female, 11 Year(s) | 052789 - Grandparent, Male, 65 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated |
| 052790 - Sibling, Female, 11 Year(s) | 052786 - Mother, Female, 31 Year(s) | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| 052790 - Sibling, Female, 11 Year(s) | 052792 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s) | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated |

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

| | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine |
|---|-------------|----|-----|---------------------|
| All children observed? | \boxtimes | | | |
| When appropriate, children were interviewed? | \boxtimes | | | |
| Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face? | \boxtimes | | | |
| All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face? | \boxtimes | | | |
| Contact with source? | \boxtimes | | | |
| All appropriate Collaterals contacted? | \boxtimes | | | |
| Was a death-scene investigation performed? | \boxtimes | | | |
| Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)? | | | | |
| Coordination of investigation with law enforcement? | \boxtimes | | | |
| Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation? | \boxtimes | | | |

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

| | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine |
|--|-------------|------------|------------|---------------------|
| Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household? | \boxtimes | | | |
| Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report: | surviving | siblings/o | ther child | lren in the |
| Within 24 hours? | \boxtimes | | | |
| At 7 days? | \boxtimes | | | |
| At 30 days? | \boxtimes | | | |
| Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours? | \boxtimes | | | |

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 8 of 19



| Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district? | | | | | |
|---|-------------|----|-----|---------------------|--|
| When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment | Profile | | | | |
| | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine | |
| Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household? | | | | | |
| Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Explain: A Neglect Petition was pending in Family Court to obtain court ordered services. Following the infant's death, the two youngest siblings were placed in Foster Care. | | | | | |
| Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality In | nvestigatio | n | | | |
| | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine | |
| Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation? | | | | | |
| Were there surviving children in the household that were removed either as a result of this fatality report / investigation or for reasons unrelated to this fatality? | | | | | |
| If Yes, court ordered? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Explain as necessary: The two youngest siblings were removed and placed in Foster Care. The oldest sibling remained in the custody of the maternal grandfather. | | | | | |
| Legal Activity Related to the Fatality | | | | | |

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 9 of 19



Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

| Services | Provided After Death | Offered, but Refused | Offered, Unknown if Used | Not Offered | Needed but Unavailable | N/A | CDR Lead to Referral |
|---|----------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------|------------------------------|-------------|----------------------------|
| Bereavement counseling | | | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Economic support | \boxtimes | | | | | | |
| Funeral arrangements | \boxtimes | | | | | | |
| Housing assistance | | | | | | \boxtimes | |
| Mental health services | | | | | | | |
| Foster care | | | | | | | |
| Health care | \boxtimes | | | | | | |
| Legal services | | | | | | | |
| Family planning | | | | \boxtimes | | | |
| Homemaking Services | | | | | | \boxtimes | |
| Parenting Skills | | | | | | | |
| Domestic Violence Services | | | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Early Intervention | | | | | | \boxtimes | |
| Alcohol/Substance abuse | | | | | | | |
| Child Care | | | | | | \boxtimes | |
| Intensive case management | \boxtimes | | | | | | |
| Family or others as safety resources | \boxtimes | | | | | | |
| Other | | | | | | \boxtimes | |
| Additional information, if necessary: The parents may have benefited from family planning services. | | | | | | | |

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

The oldest sibling was referred for grief counseling and mental health counseling.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

The parents were provided with burial assistance and referred for grief counseling and mental health counseling.

| History Prior to the Fatality |
|-------------------------------|
| |
| |

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 10 of 19

Child Information



| Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? | Yes |
|--|-----|
| Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? | No |
| Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? | Yes |
| Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death? | No |

| Infants Under One Year Old | | | | | |
|--|---|--|--|--|--|
| During pregnancy, mother: ☐ Had medical complications / infections ☐ Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs ☐ Experienced domestic violence ☐ Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed | ☐ Had heavy alcohol use ☐ Smoked tobacco ☐ Used illicit drugs | | | | |
| Infant was born: ☑ Drug exposed ☐ With neither of the issues listed noted in case record | ☐ With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome | | | | |

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

| Date of SCR Report | Alleged Victim(s) | Alleged Perpetrator(s) | Allegation(s) | Allegation Outcome | Compliance Issue(s) |
|--------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| 06/04/2019 | Sibling, Female, 1 Years | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated | No |
| | Sibling, Female, 1 Years | Father, Male, 30 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 1 Years | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 1 Years | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 6 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Deceased Child, Male, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Deceased Child, Male, 6 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Deceased Child, Male, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Deceased Child, Male, 6 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 6 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 11 Years | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Lack of Supervision | Unsubstantiated | |



| Sibling, Female, 1 Years | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Lack of Supervision | Unsubstantiated |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Deceased Child, Male, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Lack of Supervision | Unsubstantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Lack of Supervision | Unsubstantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 11 Years | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 1 Years | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated |
| Deceased Child, Male, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated |
| Deceased Child, Male, 6 Months | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Lacerations / Bruises / Welts | Unsubstantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 11 Years | Mother, Female, 31 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 11 Years | Grandparent, Male, 65 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 11 Years | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated |

Report Summary:

An SCR report alleged the mother used heroin in the presence of the children and left needles accessible to them. On one occasion, the mother nodded off and the subject infant fell of the couch and sustained bruising to his head. The father was aware of the concerns and returned the children to her care. The father was a level 3 sex offender and the mother allowed the children to return to his care. The parents engaged in physical altercations with each other in the presence of the children. The parents were not supposed to be around each other and on 6/4/19, the parents were together. A subsequent SCR report alleged the parents failed to obtain medical care for the three youngest siblings.

Report Determination: Indicated Date of Determination: 08/02/2019

Basis for Determination:

A Neglect Petition was pending in Family Court due to concerns of verbal and physical altercations between the parents and the mother's history of drug use. The mother was recommended to a higher level of treatment due to positive drug screens. The mother was not compliant with treatment and was risking her case being closed and her medication no longer being prescribed. The mother re-engaged in treatment and continued to receive her medication. The three youngest children had severe rashes and the parents did not obtain treatment in a timely manner. The mother treated the rash and it cleared up. The grandfather did not allow the oldest sibling to visit when the father was present.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS conducted a thorough investigation. They interviewed the mother, father and oldest sibling and contacted numerous collaterals. WCDSS referred the family for a multitude of services and assessed the safety of the children throughout the case. The home was assessed to be safe and safe sleep guidelines were discussed.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

| Date of SCR Report | Alleged Victim(s) | Alleged Perpetrator(s) | Allegation(s) | Allegation Outcome | Compliance Issue(s) |
|--------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| 04/06/2019 | Nibling Hemale I Vears | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Lack of Supervision | Unsubstantiated | No |

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 12 of 19



| Sibling, Female, 1 Years | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Deceased Child, Male, 5 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 5 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated |
| Deceased Child, Male, 5 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 5 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| Deceased Child, Male, 5 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 5 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated |
| Sibling, Female, 5 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated |
| Deceased Child, Male, 5 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Substantiated |
| Deceased Child, Male, 5 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Substantiated |

Report Summary:

An SCR report alleged on 4/6/19, the mother got upset with the father due to an affair the father was allegedly having. The mother went to the girlfriend's home to confront her and the father intervened and got scratched by the mother. The mother's aggressiveness placed the children at risk of harm. Subsequent reports were received on 4/10/19, 4/15/19 and 5/11/19 which alleged there were additional incidents of domestic violence, the father took the twins from the home and they did not attend the required medical appointments, and that the mother had a history of substance abuse and she was using drugs while caring the children.

Report Determination: Indicated **Date of Determination:** 06/12/2019

Basis for Determination:

There was evidence that the parents had a history of having verbal and physical altercations in the presence of the children. The mother was arrested for an altercation with the father on 4/6/19. The twins missed multiple doctor's appointments while in the care of both parents and the mother had two recent positive drug tests for cocaine. An Article 10 Neglect Petition was filed and the parents were ordered to participate in in a psychological evaluation. The mother was awarded Article 6 custody of the twins and the father had visitation. The mother remained in substance abuse services and was compliant with medication management. The Preventive Services case remained open.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS interviewed the parents and oldest sibling, and observed the three younger children. Safe sleep guidelines were discussed and the home was observed to be safe. The necessary collaterals were contacted and WCDSS appropriately filed for court ordered services.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

| Date of SCR Report | Alleged Victim(s) | Alleged Perpetrator(s) | Allegation(s) | Allegation Outcome | Compliance Issue(s) |
|--------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| 01/14/2019 | Sibling, Female, 10 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | No |
| | Sibling, Female, 10 Years | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 2 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |



Report Summary:

An SCR report alleged the father had a history of aggression towards the mother while in the presence of the siblings. The twin sibling was born premature, was medically fragile and required specific feeding and medication. She was ready to be discharged but the mother had not followed through the necessary appointments in order for her to be released to the mother's care.

Report Determination: Indicated **Date of Determination:** 03/18/2019

Basis for Determination:

The father was incarcerated and the mother failed to visit the twins at the hospital regularly. The twin sibling's discharge was delayed due to the mother not completing the required training for feeding in a timely manner. There was a history of the parents fighting in the presence of the children. The oldest sibling reported she took the one-year-old sibling outside when the parents were fighting so she could ask someone to call the police. There was an incident where the father was arrested after he obstructed EMS from assisting a neighbor because they woke up the sibling.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS interviewed the parents and oldest sibling. They discussed safe sleep recommendations with the parents and assessed the home to be safe. WCDSS contacted the necessary collaterals and verified the parents were working with Public Health Services and that the children's medical needs were being met. Safety assessment and the RAP were completed timely and accurately. The Preventive Services case remained open.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

| Date of SCR Report | Alleged Victim(s) | Alleged Perpetrator(s) | Allegation(s) | Allegation Outcome | Compliance Issue(s) |
|--------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| 11/04/2018 | Sibling, Female, 8 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated | No |
| | Sibling, Female, 8 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 8 Months | Hainer Male 311 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 8 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 10 Years | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 8 Months | Grandparent, Male, 64 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 10 Years | Grandparent, Male, 64 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |

Report Summary:

An SCR report alleged the mother and father abused heroin to the point of impairment while caring for the one-year-old sibling. A subsequent SCR report was received on 11/5/19, with allegations the maternal grandfather pushed the father in the presence of the oldest sibling and the grandfather was arrested. The oldest sibling was not harmed.

Report Determination: Indicated Date of Determination: 02/01/2019

Basis for Determination:

The grandfather and father got into a physical altercation when the father would not leave the home. The oldest sibling was scared and hid in the closet until law enforcement arrived. The grandfather was arrested for Endangering the Welfare of a Child and Harassment. This was determined to be an isolated incident.

The allegations of Parent's Drug/Alcohol Misuse against the parents and Inadequate Guardianship against the mother

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 14 of 19



were unsubstantiated as the mother was not present for the incident and she was engaged in substance abuse treatment and compliant with medication management. The father's marijuana use did not impact the children. The case remained open for Preventive Services.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS interviewed all household members and contacted the necessary collaterals. The oldest sibling was assessed to be safe in the maternal grandfather's care and the one-year-old sibling was determined to be safe in the care of the parents. The subject infant and the twin sibling were born with a positive toxicology for the mother's prescribed medication. They were admitted to the neonatal intensive care unit for an extended period of time. WCDSS assessed the twin's safety throughout the case.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

| Date of SCR Report | Alleged Victim(s) | Alleged Perpetrator(s) | Allegation(s) | Allegation Outcome | Compliance Issue(s) |
|--------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| 07/03/2018 | Sibling, Female, 4 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated | No |
| | Sibling, Female, 4 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 4 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 4 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 4 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Lack of Medical Care | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 4 Months | Father, Male, 30 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Unsubstantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 4 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Lack of Supervision | Unsubstantiated | |

Report Summary:

An SCR report alleged the mother and father were abusing heroin while they were the sole caretakers for the one-year-old sibling and there was drug paraphernalia in the home. It was alleged the parents got into an argument on 7/3/18, in the presence of the one-year-old sibling. Subsequent SCR reports were received on 7/5/18, 7/24/18 and 7/25/18 with allegations the parents were throwing objects around and the sibling was hit with a needle. It was also alleged the one-year-old sibling had a severe diaper rash and the parents did not seek treatment, and that the father was a sex offender and it was unknown if he had abused the one-year-old sibling.

Report Determination: Unfounded **Date of Determination:** 10/19/2018

Basis for Determination:

The parents had an argument in the presence of the one-year-old sibling. Law enforcement responded and drug paraphernalia was found in the bedroom. The mother said it was still in the home from previous drug use and there were no charges. The mother and father blamed each other for the altercation. The mother obtained a temporary stay away order of protection that was later dismissed. The mother tested negative for all nonprescribed substances and there was no evidence the mother was using drugs. The father tested positive for marijuana. The sibling's diaper rash was treated. The father was a level three sex offender with no restrictions and there was no evidence he abused the sibling.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS conducted a thorough investigation. The mother and father were interviewed and the necessary collaterals were contacted. Safe sleep guidelines were reviewed with the mother. Safety assessments and the RAP were completed timely

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 15 of 19



and accurately. WCDSS appropriately referred the mother for DV services and the Preventive Services case remained open.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

| Date of SCR Report | Alleged Victim(s) | Alleged Perpetrator(s) | Allegation(s) | Allegation Outcome | Compliance Issue(s) |
|--------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| 05/30/2018 | 1 5, | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | No |
| | 1 0, | | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated | |
| 1 | 1 5, | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Substantiated | |
| | Sibling, Female, 2 Months | Mother, Female, 30 Years | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Substantiated | |

Report Summary:

An SCR report alleged the mother had a history of heroin abuse. She relapsed and was under the influence of drugs while driving with the siblings in the car.

Report Determination: Indicated **Date of Determination:** 06/27/2018

Basis for Determination:

There was an incident where the mother relapsed and used cocaine. She appeared to be under the influence while caring for the siblings, drug paraphernalia was observed in the home and the mother was found passed out on the floor. A temporary safety plan was initiated that the mother would be supervised with the siblings. The mother remained engaged in substance abuse treatment and subsequently screened negative for all non-prescribed drugs. The parents appeared to be sober at all casework contacts and they appeared to be meeting the one-year-old sibling's needs. The oldest sibling remained in the grandfather's home.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS completed a thorough investigation. Safety assessments and the RAP were completed timely and accurately and the necessary collaterals were contacted. The siblings were assessed to be safe and the parents continued to engage in the required services through the open Preventive Services case.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

| Date of SCR Report | Alleged Victim(s) | Alleged Perpetrator(s) | Allegation(s) | Status/Outcome | Compliance Issue(s) |
|--------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------|------------------------|
| 03/02/2018 | Sibling, Female, 1 Days | Mother, Female, 29 Years | Inadequate Guardianship | Far-Closed | No |
| | Sibling, Female, 1 Days | | Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse | Far-Closed | |

Report Summary:

An SCR report alleged the mother tested positive for marijuana at the time she gave birth to the one-year-old sibling.

OCFS Review Results:

WCDSS appropriately tracked the case FAR. The oldest sibling was assessed to safe in the maternal grandfather's home and the one-year-old sibling was assessed to be safe in the mother's care. Necessary collaterals were contacted and it was verified that the infant tested positive for marijuana at birth. The mother continued in substance abuse services and tested negative for all non-prescribed substances after the birth of the child. The mother was referred for Preventive Services to meet identified service needs and the case was opened.

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 16 of 19



| Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes | No | | | | |
|--|-------------|-------------|------------|---------------------|--|
| CPC Investigative History Mans Than Three Vegus Bui | or to the E | atality | | | |
| CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Pri | or to the F | atailty | | | |
| There were three SCR reports investigated by Saratoga County Department of S One report was substantiated for the allegations of Inadequate Guardianship and mother and the father of the oldest sibling regarding the oldest sibling. | | | | | |
| An SCR report dated 8/22/13 was substantiated by WCDSS for the allegations of Supervision and Parent's Drug/Alcohol Misuse against the mother and the father sibling. An Article 10 Neglect Petition was filed in August 2013, the maternal g of the oldest sibling and the case was opened for Preventive Services. | of the old | dest siblin | g regardii | ng the oldest | |
| Services Open at the Time of the Fa | tality | | | | |
| Was the deceased child(ren) involved in an open preventive services case at Date the preventive services case was opened: 04/09/2018 Was the deceased child(ren) involved in an open Child Protective Services of Date the Child Protective Services case was opened: 04/09/2018 | | | · | | |
| Evaluative Review of Services that were Open at the Tir | ne of the F | atality | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine | |
| Did the service provider(s) comply with the timeliness and content requirements for progress notes? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Did the services provided meet the service needs as outlined in the case record? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Did all service providers comply with mandated reporter requirements? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Was there information in the case record that indicated the existence of behaviors or conditions that placed the children in the case in danger or increased their risk of harm? | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| Casework Contacts | | | | | |
| | | | | Unable to | |
| | Yes | No | N/A | Determine | |
| Did the service provider comply with case work contacts, including face- to-face contact as required by regulations pertaining to the program choice? | \boxtimes | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| Services Provided | | | | | |
| | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine | |

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 17 of 19



| Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? | | \boxtimes | | | | | |
|--|---|-------------|-------------|-----|---------------------|--|--|
| Were services provided to parents as necessary to achieve safety, permanency, and well-being? | | \boxtimes | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Family Assessment and Service Plan (FASP) | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine | | |
| Was the most rec | ent FASP approved on time? | | \boxtimes | | | | |
| If not, how many days was it overdue? The FASP was due on 5/8/19 and was approved 36 days late on 6/13/19. | | | | | | | |
| Was there a current Risk Assessment Profile/Risk Assessment in the most recent FASP? | | | | | | | |
| Was the FASP co | nsistent with the case circumstances? | \boxtimes | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | Closing | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine | | |
| Was the decision to close the Services case appropriate? | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Provider | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | Yes | No | N/A | Unable to Determine | | |
| Were Services provided by a provider other than the Local Department of Social Services? | | | \boxtimes | | | | |
| Additional information, if necessary: N/A | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Required Action(s) | | | | | | | |
| Are there Required Actions related to compliance issues for provisions of CPS or Preventive services ? ⊠Yes □No | | | | | | | |
| Issue: | Timeliness of completion of FASP | | | | | | |
| Summary: | The initial, comprehensive and reassessment FASPs were approved past their due dates. | | | | | | |
| Legal Reference: | 18 NYCRR428.3(f) | | | | | | |
| Action: | WCDSS will complete timely FASPs. | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 18 of 19

Preventive Services History



A Family Services Intake (FSI) was opened with WCDSS from 10/22/13-11/22/13 following an indicated SCR report against the mother and father of the oldest sibling for drug use while caring for the oldest sibling. An Article 10 Neglect Petition was filed and the sibling was placed in the Article 6 custody of the maternal grandparents. There was a finding of Neglect on 11/19/13 and a one-year suspended judgement was issued against the mother.

A Preventive Services case opened on 4/9/18 to assist the parents with mental health counseling, substance abuse treatment, domestic violence services and with finding stable housing. The oldest sibling remained in the grandfather's care. The mother had a history of drug use and was in a treatment program and medication assisted therapy. She had positive drug screens and was recommended to a higher level of treatment. The mother was not consistently attending treatment and missed appointments for her medication so the doctor was titrating her dose. The family was referred for Intensive Services and the parents were minimally cooperative. The twins were born at 26 weeks gestation and they had a very low birth weight and health issues. The parents had additional incidents of physical altercations and law enforcement involvement. An Article 10 Neglect Petition was filed and was pending in Family Court.

| | Legal History Within Three Years Pr | rior to the Fatality | | |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|--|
| Was there any lo ⊠Family Court | egal activity within three years prior to the fatality Criminal Court | investigation? Order of Protection | | |
| Family Court P | Petition Type: FCA Article 10 - CPS | | | |
| Date Filed: | Fact Finding Description: | Disposition Description: | | |
| 05/07/2019 | There was not a fact finding | There was not a disposition | | |
| Respondent: | 052786 Mother Female 31 Year(s) | | | |
| Comments: | An Article 10 Neglect Petition was filed against the mother and father and was pending at the time this report was written. The two youngest siblings were placed in Foster Care on 9/13/19 and moved to the paternal grandmother's home on 11/15/19. | | | |
| | | | | |
| Family Court P | Petition Type: FCA Article 10 - CPS | | | |
| Date Filed: | Fact Finding Description: | Disposition Description: | | |
| 05/07/2019 | There was not a fact finding | There was not a disposition | | |
| Respondent: | 052792 Father Male 31 Year(s) | | | |
| Comments: | An Article 10 Neglect Petition was filed against the mother and father and was pending at the time this report was written. The two youngest siblings were placed in Foster Care on 9/13/19 and moved to the paternal grandmother's home on 11/15/19. | | | |
| | | | | |
| Recommended Action(s) | | | | |
| - | commended actions for local or state administrati | | | |

AL-19-026 FINAL Page 19 of 19